

# For "Infant psychopathology and early interaction: From theories to practice"

Gisèle Apter

To be published in French, 2019

## **Preface: The Psychobiology of the Human Spirit**

Colwyn Trevarthen, University of Edinburgh

### *Discovering Kindness*

This is a book about kindness in care for young children, about how we need to share the inventions of our liveliness in close relationships to help with the unhappiness of emotional disorders. When we want to help a baby or toddler who is expressing sadness, or anger, or confusion and distress and who acts as if they want to be alone, we must keep confidence in the strength and optimism of the loving human spirit of playful sympathy, which they fear they cannot show (Trevarthen, 2001, 2016, 2017).

I have had the rewarding experience of many years as a researcher trying to record how, from birth, happy infants are ready to join in kindness with companions who accept the miracle of human being. According to the conventional, highly educated wisdom of some authorities in the science of intelligence or cognition this way of being alive and sharing its discoveries is not only miraculous -- it is impossible before we are able to talk about our experiences in conventional ways. They deny that there can be a psychology of the newborn (Nagy, 2011). My task, with imaginative teachers and colleagues, has been to make records of innate and developing abilities that famous experts in psychology of learning and knowing, as well as doctors caring for ill babies, have believed are not possible for the infant mind.

The biggest mystery concerns the ability of a newborn to share by imitation acts of attending, as well as delicate expressions of feelings about what is perceived together. Both Sigmund Freud (1923) and Jean Piaget (1958, 1966) said such imitation was impossible. They believed the baby had to acquire knowing, or cognition of conscious actions, by learning with parents as teachers. Awareness of life in the human world, they said, can only become meaningful by following conventions of understanding that may be described in language.

But photographic recordings of intimate and responsive exchanges with babies in the first hours after birth proved they do wish to imitate, and with astonishing discrimination and skill. Indeed they

are happy to negotiate exchanges of imitation, taking their turn and inventing new messages (Nagy and Molnár, 2004). This attentive aiming of the baby's sense organs is imaginative and creative using the wisdom of a body feeling its movements intentionally. It is not reflexive, triggered and 'conditioned' by stimuli. Thus a blind baby can look, a deaf baby can listen, making the required movements 'as if' they had sight or hearing, expecting new experience. Books for parents with eloquent photographs show how rich infant sociability normally is in intimate communication (Murray and Andrews, 2000; Nugent and Morell, 2011).

Although it is clear that this sharing of interest opens the way to cultural learning in the human way (Trevarthen, 1988, 1989, 2011), we still do not fully appreciate what the urges and feelings are that lead infants to imitate and to be imitated -- how they 'know our minds', as Vasudevi Reddy (2008) puts it. She describes the sensitive ways young babies engage expressions of interest and emotion with us. Can this be accepted as consciousness of being in company? As psychologists or neuroscientists, we do not know how our bodies and brains can do it, how they can exhibit a moral sense seeking affectionate company (Narvaez, 2014). There are now some inspiring findings using subtle analysis of the forms of expression, and new technologies of functional brain imaging, but many features of the baby's intuitions for playful 'proto-conversation' remain mysterious. A key feature is the rhythmic coordination of movements in precise synchrony that display the dimensions of pulse and tone in melodies, a 'musicality' to which we respond to so strongly (Malloch and Trevarthen, 2009; Altenmüller et al., 2015).

One important aspect of the descriptive natural science of emotions, observing how they have evolved to build social collaboration in a community, is the evidence from ethology pioneered by Charles Darwin (1972) who published pictures of how animals share emotions with shapes of expressive movement of parts of the body that are adapted to be seen or heard. Anthropological studies, since his voyage of discovery of other races in the early 19th Century, proved for Darwin there are universal human expressions of relating in social worlds ready to support the learning of very different traditions of knowledge, art and technologies. Babies everywhere respond to loving care, imitate, and enjoy play with familiar companions. That is their special human vitality prepared for joining a rich and ancient cultural life. It is the resource that psychotherapy depends on to help afraid and shamed persons of any age recover contented and optimistic vitality.

***Biology is the Science of Life. Psychobiology is Biology of the Mind: We are Born Sharing the Drama of Life, For Love***

Every living organism, plant or animal, grows or moves with initiative and imagination, seeking with its evolved life-form a healthy and rewarding existence -- a Self-creating and Self-protecting way of being. This depends on processes that plan and evaluate actions in invented time of moving, making measured steps into the future with anticipation of rewards of well-being and avoidance of harm (Bernstein, 1966, 1967; Goodrich, 2010).

New brain science, breaking free of the idea that intelligence is built by training reflexes or 'conditioning' them, confirms that the feelings of value for human consciousness of an active and aware person arise deep in the brain with emotional power to direct knowing. "The subcortical level would ensure basic feeling states while the cortical level would largely relate feeling states to cognitive processes such as decision-making and imagination" (Damasio et al., 2013, p. 833).

The Venezuelan biologist, systems theorist and language philosopher Humberto Maturana (1978; Maturana and Varela, 1980) describes the processes of life as of two kinds with different, complementary, purposes; *autopoiesis* or 'self-making' grows within the shaped vitality of a dynamic body, and *consensuality*, makes mutual support in communities of beings, appreciating and adapting to the resources of the physical environment and negotiating with other lively selves. Maturana's colleague Francisco Varela, with Evan Thompson and Eleanor Rosch, describes how the mind is 'embodied' by the animated form it grows within (Varela, Thompson and Rosch, 1991).

As human beings, we grow and prosper with mastery of the most complex and versatile animal bodies made for many new ways of moving to investigate and manipulate a rich world (Bernstein, 1996) -- and we talk about it. We strive to cooperate in the great consensus of meanings we value as our culture, a history of inventive being and making by gifted individuals living through generations in artful companionship. And, as speaking creatures we use the skill that Maturana calls 'languaging', which includes more than speaking and writing. It is ways of moving to make up stories that describe old ways of being and invent new ones (Bruner, 2003). We become authors of our *Self As Agent* and live as *Persons in Relation* (Macmurray, 1959 and 1961).

### ***The Infant Mind is Full of Feeling for Measures of Movement In Company***

Supported by insights from new findings of anthropology and animal ethology, the veteran educational psychologist Jerome Bruner, who was always seeking new ideas about the nature of culture and its transmission, collaborated with pediatrician Berry Brazelton in the late 1960s to study infant initiatives to perceive and use objects, and the intimate reciprocal imitation that develops between infants and affectionate parents and caregivers who offer playful collaboration with the child's rhythms and qualities of movement (Bruner, 1968). Film studies showed that young

infants make complex shifts of posture and hand gestures that are regulated rhythmically in time, with measures of pulsation that match those of the same movements made by adults. In face-to-face play a baby often takes the lead with 'narratives' of expressive acts that are imitated joyfully by the mother.

At Harvard, as a doctoral student in Bruner's group, I recorded how a baby's eyes and head move in precise synchrony to look at, or track, an object of interest, expressing the baby's sense of self. In looking, a baby's measured steps or saccades made consistent rhythms that were the same as those of an adult scanning a picture. By six months the infants had developed efficient binocular depth perception, and by precisely moving their eyes and head together they could track a slowly moving object smoothly, without saccades, which is a skill that requires a mental prediction of the object's path and its velocity. Tracings I made of infants, one or two months old, reaching out to touch or grasp objects were regulated in elegant patterns with rhythms that were close to those of an adult reach-and-grasp (Trevarthen, 1974). There were innate rules of self-conscious vitality in human beings who were very different in body size and breadth of knowledge.

This 'motor intelligence' of the baby ready for engaging with things to be seen and grasped in the world was astonishing. But even more remarkable were the body movements of communication with attention directed to an interested mother. These were creative, prosocial and mutually regulated. They included delicate face expressions of emotion, like a smile or a scowl, deliberate eye-to-eye contact, 'prespeech' movements of the lips and dramatic gestures of the hands (Trevarthen, 1979). These movements of a conscious self can only have a desired effect if they are sensed sympathetically by another human being. And, the baby could take the lead, in the 'dialogue'. They were not simply imitating the expressions of their mothers. They wanted a cooperative engagement of their interests and feelings to discover new ideas.

We made films at 16 frames per second, week by week, with five infants and their mothers from two to six months of age. We compared how each infant behaved towards the mother herself, and to a suspended toy presented by her. The room was a quiet studio surrounded by heavy curtains, with subdued lighting. A camera was aimed to take a full-face view of the whole baby, and a mirror placed behind the baby gave a head and shoulders view of the mother. We filmed the mother and infant enjoying intimate chat, undisturbed.

A 'conversation' between 12-week-old Jody and his mother, in which the baby clearly led the engagement, was an eye-opener. This leading by the baby was confirmed by further micro-analysis of the body movements of infants of the same age when they were communicating with their

delighted mothers. Infants rarely imitated the mother in these 'proto-conversations'. They had their own stories to tell, and the mothers followed the plot with confirming and encouraging expressions.

When a baby is born we, if we are ready to respond with affection, meet an active, interested and sensitive human person who senses our readiness for dialogues of expressive movement. We find ourselves measuring life-time together and exchange expressions of love -- seeking a shared gaze, a smile, or puzzled look, hand gestures of enquiry, pointing with focused interest or of self-comforting -- all rhythmic and immediately connected to join or alternate with our signs of affectionate companionship (Osborne, 2017).

This partaking in sympathetic vitality is not new for the infant. It has been practiced for months within the mother's body, often, in the last few months of gestation, responding to the impulses and tensions of pleasure and pain in her life as a person, sometimes aware of the lively behaviors of other people nearby, speaking, touching, moving objects. If the baby is born before term, still in the stage of a fetal apprentice in human companionship, the mother, who is now seen and heard with more immediate and complex presence must be responsive in gently expressive ways if she is to continue giving intimate care as the baby expects she will. The sensitivity and special intimacy of her support and nurture must adapt to the strong but immature sensibilities and accommodations of the baby.

This is the intimate relationship between them which pediatrician Lou Sander described as a 'living system' (Sander, 2008). The English pediatrician and psychoanalyst Donald Winnicott described the mother's care as a 'holding environment' that is essential to the child's developing Self. He said, "the foundations of health are laid down by the ordinary mother in her ordinary loving care of her own baby" (Winnicott, 1964). This holding applies to the environment of family and society that Professor of Psychology Darcia Narvaez and her colleagues call the Evolved Developmental Niche for the human infant, a species of mammal born needing many months of support, feeding and protection of affectionate care from mother, father, and a close community of neighbours of all ages (Narvaez et al., 2016).

The gracious and constructive emotional relating between parent and baby is what the medical caregivers call 'attunement' to the baby's expressions of need. It needs to be timed and with the right tones to complement what the baby seeks and feels, and to reduce or remove any compelling and stressful intrusions in the baby's experience and sense of comfort, and their enjoyment of a new and much richer awareness.

### *A History of Responsive Medical Care For the Newborn Person.*

Our post-industrial scientific culture developed a scientific medical treatment of disorders as if the receiver of care were a reflex organism, needing attention focused on anatomy and internal physiological state only. It relied on diagnosis to identify faults in development of sensory-motor or visceral functions, or to detect symptoms of abnormal physiology or injuries and infections that cause harm.

Then some doctors saw this was too narrow, and they insisted on creating a new compassionate awareness of the newborn as a person with strong powers of imaginative action and human ways of signaling and responding to interests and feelings.

In 1935, René Spitz used direct observation of spontaneous mindful behaviour of children rather than tests of their reflex responses to artificial stimuli. His work revealed the serious effects of deprivation of a mother's love on her child's sense of well-being. He coined the term "anaclitic depression" to refer to the immediate effect on a newborn baby, and showed that if children are deprived of a mother's care for longer than five months, they will show symptoms of increasingly serious deterioration, which he called "hospitalism." Observing children in a foundling home in the United States, he confirmed that poor care during the children's first year results in irreparable damage to their spirit for life and learning (Spitz, 1945). His film *Psychogenic Disease in Infancy* changed childcare in homes and hospitals.

John Bowlby, in England, worked with maladjusted and delinquent children as a psychologist before he qualified in medicine and later as a psychoanalyst. He helped children who were evacuated from London to Cambridge during a time of war and separated from their families and nannies. One of his main findings was that children described as 'affectionless', and likely to become thieves, had experienced complete and prolonged separation before the age of five. Bowlby's work led to his writing the World Health Organization's report on the mental health of homeless children in post-war Europe, published as *Maternal Care and Mental Health* in 1951.

The Attachment Theory of Spitz and Bowlby confirmed the needs of the young child for affectionate protection and care. It also encouraged growth of interest in infants' emotions for playful discovery of life in a human world, which inspired doctors responsible for care of babies at birth to treat the babies and their parents with more sympathy and humour.

In the 1960s three doctors independently called for a revolution in the care of birth and early development, and for attention to the special needs of prematurely born persons.

These three doctors, Leboyer in Paris, and Sander and Brazelton in Boston (all of whom were born in 1918 at the end of a world war) perceived newborns as alert playful persons seeking love in companionship beyond attachment for comfort and feeding of weak bodies. They were led by their sensitivity and imagination to reject the prejudice of their professional training that infants have no awareness of what they are doing, or sensitivity to other people's emotions or attitudes. Their attention to the powers of innate human conviviality supported a move away from Freud's psychotherapy, which, with little appreciation of the positive motives and feelings of an infant, had become preoccupied with listening to the patient's talking about memories of trauma experienced at what was understood to be a more primitive stage of the Self. The three doctors urged a richer appreciation of the psycho-biology of emotions and the communication of gentle love and playfulness in movement, and they promoted new ideas about the readiness of children for learning cultural skills and beliefs, and how they wanted to share these with self-confidence. Their work supported a change to more intimate 'relational' psychotherapy.

Frédéric Leboyer, a French obstetrician who left his medical practice to become a famous author writing on the powers of the infant to stimulate loving care, is best known for his 1974 book, *Pour Une Naissance Sans Violence*. He introduced the practice of immersing the newborn in a tub of warm water, known as a "Leboyer bath", to ease the transition to the outside world. He also advocated low lighting in a quiet warm room to limit the stress of birth, and that the baby be first laid on the mother's stomach and allowed to bond, instead of being taken away for tests. His own birth was traumatic with his distressed mother forcefully restrained, and Leboyer attributes his interest in birth to this experience. In *Pour Une Naissance Sans Violence* he advises that, "sharing love is the sovereign remedy for anguish." Other books he wrote that have been translated and become popular in English include *Loving Hands: The Traditional Art of Baby Massage*, and *Inner Beauty, Inner Light*.

The pediatrician Louis Sander made two crucial contributions. With William Condon, who used microanalysis of rhythmic movements to study speech and gesture in adult conversation, Sander confirmed that a newborn baby's hand movements may synchronize with adult speech, matching, or 'attuning' to, the rhythms of two very different forms of body action (Condon and Sander, 1974). This inspired careful attention to the timing and emotional intensity of infants' movements and their precise engagement with sympathetic rhythms of their mother's behaviour. Furthermore, in a project to trace the development of communication between mothers and their children from birth to age 6 years, Sander and his colleagues demonstrated that a strong and creative childhood is fostered by a collaboration of the baby's efforts to learn supported by the innate talents of the mother – her readiness to take part in an adaptive learning that responds to developments of expressions and

actions in the child (Sander, 1962, 1964). He recognised that mother and baby form a single living system to which both are adapted (Sander 2008).

Confirmation of mutual regulation of development of an imaginative mind from birth was obtained by Olga Maratos in her PhD thesis, in which she reported of the development of imitative expressions through the first 6 months of infants when they are attentive to an adult who is instinctively seeking sympathetic engagement with the baby's motives and feelings (Maratos, 1982). She presented her findings in 1973 to her supervisor in Geneva, Jean Piaget, who did not believe newborns are conscious enough to imitate. He remained sceptical.

The new understanding of the creative mental abilities of infants and their readiness for intimate, two-way collaborative learning, not 'instruction', was inspired by the sensitive work of the Boston pediatrician, T. Berry Brazelton. Creating his *Neonatal Behavioral Assessment Scale* for use to help early detection of developmental disorders (Brazelton, 1973; Brazelton and Nugent, 1995), Brazelton perceived that, from the very beginning of life outside the mother's body, an infant is gifted with rhythmic 'musical' sensibilities for imaginative play and ready to start cultural learning by imitating and engaging sensitively with actions and expressions of both mother and father. He said, "The old model of thinking of the newborn infant as helpless and ready to be shaped by his environment prevented us from seeing his power as a communicant in the early mother-father-infant interaction. To see the neonate as chaotic or insensitive provided us with the capacity to see ourselves as acting 'on' rather than 'with' him." (Brazelton, 1979, p. 79)

Like Sander, and Maratos, Brazelton drew attention to the developing child's initiative to pass through age-related steps, in both their own powers of activity and in readiness for collaboration, which he called 'touchpoints' (Brazelton, 1982, 1993, 2002). His *Touchpoints Model of Development* has become a world famous institution to support parent's intuitive concern to accompany their children tenderly through changes in life's opportunities that come with transforming powers and feelings of human body movement (Brazelton and Sparrow, 2006; Lester and Sparrow, 2012).

### ***Affective Attunement of Vitality Dynamics, Leading to a New Psychotherapy***

In 1961, Dan Stern, a young pediatrician being trained in psychoanalysis in New York began a revolutionary career in the study of the natural origins of human compassion and understanding. He watched a film of a mother with three-month-old twins enjoying teasing play, with precisely coordinated moves timed to fractions of a second to make collaborative patterns of the game (Stern, 1971). With colleagues in Columbia University and Harvard, that work, which proved the



intelligent initiative of the child to 'attune' and synchronise with an adult's intentions (Stern et al., 1977), inspired a critical reassessment of the baby's mindless, primitive and instinctive 'Id' invented by Freud, which requires a 'moralizing' education to become a responsible 'Ego'.

Stern was long associated with the New York City Ballet, and theatre artists, dancers and choreographers were enthralled by his microscopic investigations of how mothers and infants invent drama together in play. His subsequent clinical work led to publication in 1985 of *The Interpersonal World of the Infant*. In the Preface he declares 'This book attempts to create a dialogue between the infant as revealed by the experimental approach and as clinically constructed, in the sense of resolving the contradiction between theory and reality' (Stern, 1985/2000: ix). He became committed to a psychotherapy of lived experience and 'moments of meeting' as critical for the making and remembering of 'emotional narrative envelopes' in dialogue.

In 1999 Stern took a leading part in the announcement of a group of psychotherapists who accepted that emotional foundations of self-awareness and self-confidence in relationships could be given new strength by open acceptance of momentary expressions of hope and conviction and developed in shared dynamic emotional narratives of 'Implicit Relational Knowing' (Stern et al., 1999).

In a new Introduction to the paperback edition of *The Interpersonal World of the Infant* he wrote:

"One consequence of the book's application of a narrative perspective to the non-verbal has been the discovery of a language useful to many psychotherapies that rely on the non-verbal. I am thinking particularly of dance, music, body, and movement therapies, as well as existential psychotherapies. This observation came as a pleasant surprise to me since I did not originally have such therapists in mind; my thinking has been enriched by coming to know them better." (Stern, 2000, p. xv).

Indeed, in the final decade of the 20th Century there was an outpouring of publications on the use and beneficial effects of music therapy. A leader in this work was the musician and psychologist Mercedes Pavlicevic who developed her work at the Nordoff Robbins Music Therapy Centre in London and the Music Therapy Community Clinic, Cape Town, South Africa (Pavlicevic, 1997, 1999; Pavlicevic and Trevarthen, 1989; Pavlicevic et al., 1994; Pavlicevic and Ansdell, 2009). This and other 'relational therapies' give privileged attention to the non-verbal aspects of the therapeutic engagement, which are so important for any sharing of emotions of creative vitality in pairs or in groups of any size. For example *Video Interaction Guidance* developed in the Netherlands by Harrie Biemans and colleagues in the 1980's, and now practised in more than 15 countries helping professionals in social work, education and health, and also in business management (Kennedy et al., 2011).

Throughout his highly influential career, Stern was entranced by the 'living moment' of companionship between the developing child and parent, and what it can teach us about the natural foundations of psychotherapy that accepts the need for sensitive engagement of ideas and feelings between therapist and a patient of whatever age, by communication of the vitality and grace of body movements (Stern, 2007, 2010).

### ***Musicality of Our Body Moving Inspires Adventures of Collaboration In a Lifetime of Learning***

Musician and counsellor Stephen Malloch and I have used evidence of the musical abilities of young infants to develop a theory of 'communicative musicality' to describe the essential features of rhythm and attunement of vitality in body movements that put shared enjoyment of life into dance and music (Malloch, 1999; Malloch and Trevarthen, 2009). What these expressive arts share with the ritual performances of theatre is what the anthropologist Victor Turner (1982) called *The Human Seriousness of Play*. It is serious experience of enjoyable performance because it transmits the essential powers of self-regulated body movement in any human actor, to keep alive a harmony of muscle forces and the pleasure felt as well-being in inner vital functions.

Thinking of the different media of this body-to-body communication, by sight or by sound and vibrations produced in performance of any activity, we discover that the essential messages are 'amodal' or 'transmodal' with respect to the distance senses that are adapted to explore the out-of-body world with sight, sound and touch. Music and dance communicate with or imitate proprioceptive and viscerosceptive sensations inside different bodies of co-performers, or between performers and audience or viewers. Like the mystery of neonatal imitation, the intrinsic forces of artful communication engage sympathetic feelings in a way that escapes the facts of external reality. The Norwegian social psychologist Stein Bråten has spent his life confronting the paradox of knowledge and reality, helping us by relating this to the communicative intuitions of infants (Bråten, 1988, 1998, 2007, 2009).

Of fundamental importance is the evidence of how sensitive newborn infants, and even fetuses, are for music, and for the prosody of a mother's voice. We are born trans-modal communicators in the body-consciousness of moving. Our ears and throats, as well as eyes, face and hands, are adapted to express tones of emotion as signals of vitality (Porges, 2011), as are the dynamics of locomotion by walking and running and by hand gestures. This is the language of Birdwhistell's kinesics (Birdwhistell, 1970), or Stern's vitality dynamics (Stern, 2010).

Two words grasp the principle of a trans-modal sympathy in sensations of purposeful life -- 'attunement' and 'harmony'. Both refer to the expressive use of the voice or of actions making

rhythmic patterns of the sound and sight in other individuals that evoke our inner sensations of body movement, which may be celebrated by song, instrumental performance or dance. These psychodynamic forces give vitality to any form of communication, and aid the cooperative direction of interests and actions (Osborne, 2017).

The power of music imagines into the future and recalls rich moments of our past by its natural ability to portray projects of moving in melodies that have the appealing form of narratives. They exhibit a wave of excitement and commitment with dramatic phases of *introduction*, *development*, *climax* and *resolution* (or *coda*) (Malloch, 1999, 2017). This portrays the plan of human purposeful movement and its willingness to be shared as a drama. It appeals to the dramatic interest of a baby a few months old in a holding lullaby or a baby song accompanied by teasing hand actions.

The spiritual poetry is most evident when it is composed and enjoyed in the spontaneous playful way of an innocent young child, or of a great artist. When all attention is given to abstract rules of structure and to precision of measures in repetition between performances of a given story, the beauty of living creation in the life-time of movements with affection may be weakened or lost. Any story, conveyed by any medium, verbal or non-verbal, has forms that may become directed in the rules of syntax and grammar of language, on which the authority or 'significance' of semantics in an established vocabulary depends. Too much attention to the referential message pretending objective truth destroys the 'poetry', the subjective making of the message.

### ***Humanistic Philosophy and Enlightened Relations***

In the 18th Century, a new philosophy of natural life in a community developed in protestant Scotland. It was led by Francis Hutcheson, a Presbyterian from Ireland educated in the University of Glasgow, who became an eloquent and very popular public speaker in that city. He became one of the founding fathers of the Scottish Enlightenment, and is famous for his book "*A System of Moral Philosophy*" based on belief in 'natural sympathy' (Hutcheson, 1755/2013). His followers David Hume (1739), Adam Smith (1759, 1777), and Thomas Reid (1764) developed this theory of a human nature based on compassionate common sense, which grows from the fundamental powers of non-verbal arts of expression, including music. Modern psychobiology supports this view of human well-being and effective reasoning in a life of relationships, both intimate and political, and how it depends on honest sharing of feelings of aesthetic grace and moral virtue.

## ***Relational-Affective Psychotherapy, Recognizing the Intuitive Motives of Young Children for Cultural Learning***

Important developments in therapy to help children or adults who have lost confidence in their impulses to find meaning and enjoyment by sharing life experiences affectionately and playfully, have gained from close attention to the way most infants happily contribute to building strong affectionate and creative relations with family and neighbors in joyful rituals of teasing play (Jernberg, 1979).

As Daniel Stern demonstrated, knowledge of how young infants participate in interpersonal life and form intimate and confident relationships with parents, siblings and friends reveals the power of shared vitality and its discoveries and values. This power grows to animate cultural creativity and symbolic communication in language, and it also leads to a more collaborative approach for therapy to aid young children who do not engage and who exhibit anxious loneliness.

Among close associates of Sigmund Freud who debated with him the theory of psychoanalysis, Sándor Ferenczi, in 1932, with an address entitled *Confusion of Tongues* to fellow analysts at a meeting in Germany, opened a way to mutuality in more intimate and reciprocal or relational therapy, not one in which the therapist 'stands back' and interprets the patient's recollections of trauma. Forty years later the psychobiology of infancy confirmed that, indeed, it is our nature to find shared meaning for the actions we can perform with our agile and expressive bodies. From birth we seek collective urges and ambitions. This view of self-creative and cooperative development encouraged therapists working with children who had lost confidence in their social desires and who could not share joyful feelings with trusted friends, to try to find re-vitalization of their spirit. It was clear they needed help to recall and trust the experience of love in kindness, not just courage to overcome memories of trauma.

As we have noted, Donald Winnicott, like Louis Sander, drew attention to the natural support of a mother's intimate, affectionate care for her baby (Winnicott, 1987). In *The Maturational Process and the Facilitating Environment* (Winnicott, 1965) he observed that mental health of a child is developed by, "the continuation of reliable holding in terms of the ever-widening circle of family and school and social life". Renouncing the primary aim of his psychoanalytic training, he sought positive ways to restore the deep sympathetic spirit of companionship, and he wrote, "A correct and well-timed interpretation in an analytic treatment gives a sense of being held physically that is more real...than if a real holding or nursing had taken place. Understanding goes deeper". His trust in the infant's experience of loving maternal care also led him to give special importance to play in the development of a rich and real experience of the meaning of life (Winnicott, 1958). He was thus,

with René Spitz (1957), a pathfinder to kinds of psychotherapy that require gentle invitation to negotiate joy in moving with playful invention. This approach was developed by Ann Jernberg as Theraplay (Jernberg, 1979; Jernberg and Booth, 2001; Booth and Jernberg, 2010)

Other clinicians, seeking to give effective help to children with weakened social responsiveness, or who had suffered from loss of kind maternal care and were taken into adoption, followed Winnicott's lead. Peter Hobson, a Professor of Developmental Psychopathology at University College London became known for his work on autism and experimental child psychology, which lead him to question the prevailing cognitive psychology of thinking (Hobson, 1989), and to adopt a theory of the growth of human intelligence in intimate, affectionate communication, summarized in *The Cradle of Thought* (Hobson, 2002). He considered the main weakness of children diagnosed as autistic was not lack of a 'theory of mind', but an inability to use emotions for reaching out to others (Hobson, 1984, 1991, 1993; Hobson et al., 1988). They do not feel intimate engagement with the playful and caring impulses of parents and other companions. He, with Jessica Hobson, came to appreciate how this casts light on the role of feelings in normal development, and their changes as the infant and young child gains new powers of moving to use the world and to communicate experiences in shared learning (Hobson and Hobson, 2011).

Peter Hobson's inviting or encouraging method of therapy for autistic children, helping them to appreciate and identify with the attitudes of other people, became a highly influential 'conversational model'. He has also studied the relations of a mother with her infant when she displays the abnormal, insensitive, behaviour of borderline personality disorder, and how she transmits her pathology to her child (Hobson, et al., 2005).

Hobson's conversational model has been taken up by Emeritus Professor of Psychiatry Russell Meares of the University of Sydney (Meares, 2004). Use of Hobson's method led him to develop effective methods of treatment for borderline personality disorder (Meares et al., 2012), proving the value of assistance for more intimate engagement of purposes and feelings with people who experience a fragile sense of self. Meares has written two thought-provoking books on the importance of artful play with engagements for freeing psychiatric patients from anxieties and shame in relationships -- *The Metaphor of Play: Origin and Breakdown of Personal Being* (Meares, 2005), and *The Poet's Voice in the Making of Mind* (2016). Both books acknowledge the insights gained from research on the development of intimate communication and shared imagination in infancy.

In the past thirty years a clinical psychologist Dan Hughes has tested a treatment to support families with adopted or fostered children, giving them guidance to build strong affectionate relationships

with boys and girls who had experienced neglect and abuse in their birth families and were suffering from developmental trauma (Hughes, 1997, 2006) . He was inspired by the Attachment Theory of Spitz and Bowlby and new understanding of how normal development of a healthy childhood depends on the active and creative life from birth in affectionate and playful companionship with parents and children.

Hughes draws on the 'relational neuroscience' of Dan Siegel (2012) and Alan Schore (2001, 2003) who report remarkable developments in understanding of how the developing human brain actively seeks to share motives for discovery of meaning in the world, and how body and brain are designed to build memories of life's meanings in affectionate relationships, with loved ones. Within a relationship, the brain can function in a more integrative and restorative manner in spontaneous communication of impulses and feelings with a trusted other to help to make sense of highly stressful events in order to reduce the fear or shame they inspire. Stephen Porges (2011) describes regions of the brain that make up the Social Engagement System, in which individuals learn about themselves and others with a sense of safety.

When the therapist and caregiver using the insights of DDP are able to establish safety and acceptance, the adopted child is less likely to be defensive and withdrawn and more ready to enjoy sharing habits with pride, in attunement.

“In healthy families, a baby forms a secure attachment with her parents as naturally as she breathes, eats, smiles and cries. This occurs easily because of her parents’ attuned interactions with her. Her parents notice her physiological/affective states and they respond to her sensitively and fully. Beyond simply meeting her unique needs, however, her parents “dance” with her. Hundreds of times, day after day, they dance with her. There are other families where the baby neither dances nor even hears the sound of any music. In these families she does not form such secure attachments. Rather, her task – her continuous ordeal – is to learn to live with parents who are little more than strangers. Babies who live with strangers do not live well or grow well.” (Hughes, 2006, page ix)

Hughes' experience with neglected and abused children led him to change his communication with them by adopting a more hopeful and cooperative invitation to share life with pride.

“Many, many years ago I reflected on my frequent inability to help children who had been abused and neglected ... My initial goals were to help them to be less terrified by the traumatic events of their past. When I found I wasn't successful with this I developed other goals, which focused on helping them to reduce the deep sense of shame they felt and which underpinned their conviction that they deserved the maltreatment that they had received.”

He developed his practice for 'Dyadic Developmental Psychotherapy' now used in many countries. The DDPI (Dyadic Developmental Psychotherapy Institute) provides training, certification, and supervision for Dyadic Developmental Psychotherapy and Practice in Portland Maine, USA (Hughes, 2011).

### ***Reaching to the Source of Values to Be Shared and Remembered in Lively Movement***

The human spirit is motivated for sharing the meaning and pleasure of life with excitement and rituals that confirm rewarding conventions of practice. These are based on the vitality of a mammal with special powers of cooperation in large creative and adventurous societies. Sometimes these powers are betrayed or misguided in ways that harm relations and confuse meanings they should live by with actions that are destructive and cruel (Bråten, 2013). Then we must seek to recover contact in harmony with the basic values of the first stages of innocent life with other persons.

I would like to end by confirming that we find both aesthetic and moral values expressed in joyful play with children too young to appreciate talk about how to behave. The source of the emotions of grace and kindness appears to be in the way movements of a very complex body are harmonised through self-generated time of vitality, as Goodrich explains, and how they seek to cooperate in the graceful rhythms of their energy with other actors who wish to share and contribute to their invention with beauty (Daniel and Trevarthen, 2017; Trevarthen and Malloch, 2017).

From the meticulous science of motor control developed by Bernstein and the analysis of vitality dynamics by Stern we appreciate the importance of a sense of the future in this moving that makes stories that need no words. This supports a psychotherapy which the Harvard trained medical doctor Mark Epstein in *Thoughts Without a Thinker* describes as 'from a Buddhist perspective' (Epstein, 1995). In that book the Foreword by the Dalai Lama begins with this confession: "The purpose of life is to be happy. As a Buddhist I have found that one's own mental attitude is the most influential factor in working toward that goal. In order to change conditions outside themselves, whether they concern the environment or relations with others, we must first change within ourselves." Epstein's therapy values inner grace and harmony, and moral responsibility in relationships. Stephen Malloch (2017, p. 69), with his life as a violinist, conductor, and therapist, and as someone who holds to the Buddhist faith, declares that "the therapeutic relationship is a piece of music, experienced in the unfolding present", in which the participants seek to improvise a balance of responsibility.

A turn in relational neuroscience accepts the primacy of feelings in the inspiration of practical and rational awareness, in the graceful economy of actions, and in the moral concessions of kind relations. Recognising these as the fundamental processes of all our endeavours is what

characterises relational therapies, especially to assist young children who need to retrieve happiness in friendship in rhythms of relating (Daniel and Trevarthen, 2017).



## References

- Altenmüller, E., Finger, S., and Boller, F. (2015). Music, Neurology, Neuroscience Evolution, the Musical Brain, Medical Conditions, and Therapies. *Progress in Brain Research* No. 217. Elsevier
- Bernstein, N. (1966). *The Active Search for Information: From Reflexes to the Model of the Future*. (In Russian) Republished in English by Feigenberg, I. M., & Meijer, O. G. (1999). The active search for information: From reflexes to the model of the future. *Motor Control*, 3, 225-236
- Bernstein, N. (1967). *The Coordination and Regulation of Movements*. Oxford: Pergamon.
- Bernstein, N. (1996). Dexterity and its development. In, Latash M. L. and Turvey, M. T. (Eds.) *Dexterity and its Development*, Lawrence Erlbaum, New Jersey. 1-235.
- Birdwhistell, R. (1970). *Kinesics and Context*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Booth, P. and Jernberg, A. M. (2010). *Theraplay: Helping Parents and Children Build Better Relationships Through Attachment-Based Play*. John Wiley and Sons. San Francisco CA: Jossey-Bass
- Bråten, S. (1988). Between dialogical mind and monological reason: Postulating the virtual other. In M. Campanella (Ed.), *Between Rationality and Cognition*, (pp. 205-235). Turin: Albert Meynier.
- Bråten, S. (1998). Intersubjective communion and understanding: Development and perturbation. In S. Bråten (Ed.), *Intersubjective Communication and Emotion in Early Ontogeny*, (pp. 372-382). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bråten, S. (2007). *On Being Moved: From Mirror Neurons to Empathy*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company
- Bråten, S. (2009). *The Intersubjective Mirror in Infant Learning and Evolution of Speech*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Bråten, S. (2013). *Roots and Collapse of Empathy: Human nature at its best and at its worst*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Brazelton, T. B. (1973) *Neonatal Behavioural Assessment Scale* (Clinics in Developmental Medicine, 50. Spastics International Medical Publications) London: Heinemann Medical Books.
- Brazelton, T. B. (1979) Evidence of communication during neonatal behavioural assessment. In M. Bullowa (ed.), *Before Speech: The Beginning of Human Communication*. London, Cambridge University Press., pp. 79-88.
- Brazelton, T. B. (1982) Joint regulation of neonate-parent behavior. In: E. Z. Tronick (Ed.) *Social Interchange in Infancy: Affect, Cognition and Communication*. Baltimore: University Park Press.
- Brazelton, T. B. (1993). *Touchpoints: Your Child's Emotional and Behavioral Development*. New York: Viking.
- Brazelton, T. B. (2002). Strengths and stresses in today's families: Looking toward the future. In J. Gomes-Pedro, J. K. Nugent, J. G. Young, & T. B. Brazelton (Eds.) *The Infant and Family In the Twenty-First Century* (pp. 23-30). New York/Hove, UK: Brunner-Routledge.
- Brazelton, T. B, and Nugent JK (1995) *The Neonatal Behavioural Assessment Scale*, 3rd Edition. MacKeith Press, London.
- Brazelton, T. B. and Sparrow, J. D. (2006). *Touchpoints 0-3: Your Child's Emotional and Behavioral Development* (2nd edition). Cambridge (MA): Da Capo Press.
- Bruner, J. S. (1968). *Processes of Cognitive Growth: Infancy*. (Heinz Werner Lectures, 1968) Worcester, Mass: Clark University Press with Barri Publishers.

- Bruner, J. S. (2003). *Making Stories: Law, Literature, Life*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press
- Condon, W. S. and Sander, L. S. (1974). Neonate movement is synchronized with adult speech. Interactional participation and language acquisition. *Science*, 183, 99-101.
- Daniel, S. and Trevarthen, C. (2017). (Eds.) *Rhythms of Relating in Children's Therapies: Connecting Creatively with Vulnerable Children*. London: Jessica Kingsley.
- Darwin, C. (1872) *The Expression of Emotion in Man and Animals*. London, Methuen.
- Epstein, M. (1995). *Thoughts Without a Thinker: Psychotherapy from a Buddhist perspective*. New York: Basic Books.
- Ferenczi, S. (1933). Confusion de langue entre les adultes et l'enfant, In *Psychanalyse* 4, Paris: Payot, 1982
- Freud, S. (1923). *Das Ich und das Es (The Ego and the Id)*. Vienna: Internationaler Psycho-Analytischer Verlag/ New York: W. W. Norton & Company
- Goodrich, B. G. (2010). We Do, Therefore We Think: Time, Motility, and Consciousness. *Reviews in the Neurosciences* 21, 331-361.
- Hobson, P. (2002) *The Cradle of Thought: Exploring the Origins of Thinking*. London: Macmillan.
- Hobson, R. P. (1984). Early childhood autism and the question of egocentrism. *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 14: 85-104.
- Hobson, R. P. (1989). Beyond cognition: A theory of autism. In G. Dawson (ed), *Autism: Nature, diagnosis, and treatment*. New York, NY, US: Guilford Press, pp. 22-48.
- Hobson, R. P. (1991). Against the theory of 'theory of mind'. *British Journal of Developmental Psychology*, 9, 33-51. On the affective basis of interpersonal understanding.
- Hobson, R. P. (1993) *Autism and the Development of Mind*, Lawrence Erlbaum, Hove.
- Hobson, R. P., and Hobson, J. A. (2011). Joint attention or joint engagement? Insights from autism. In, A. Seemann (Ed.) *Joint Attention: New Developments in Philosophy, Psychology, and Neuroscience*. (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press), pp. 115–135.
- Hobson, R. P., Ouston, J. and Lee, A. (1988) Emotion recognition in autism; coordinating faces and voices. *Psychological Medicine*, 18: 911-923.
- Hobson, R. P., Patrick, M., Crandell, L., García-Pérez, R., and Lee A. (2005). Personal relatedness and attachment in infants of mothers with borderline personality disorder. *Developmental Psychobiology*, 17(2): 329-347.
- Hughes, D. (1997). *Facilitating Developmental Attachment: The Road to Emotional Recovery and Behavioral Change in Foster and Adopted Children*. New York: Jason Aronson.
- Hughes, D. (2006) *Building the Bonds of Attachment: Awakening Love in Deeply Traumatized Children*. 2nd Ed. Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield
- Hughes, D. (2011). *Attachment-Focused Family Therapy Workbook*. New York: Norton.
- Hume, D. (1739) *A Treatise on Human Nature: An Attempt to Introduce the Experimental Method of Reasoning Into Moral Subjects*. London: John Noon
- Hutcheson, F. (1755/2013). *A System of Moral Philosophy 2 Volume Set: A System of Moral Philosophy: In Three Books: Volume 1* (Cambridge Library Collection - Philosophy) Reprint Edition, 2013. New York: Cambridge University Press

- Jernberg, A. M. (1979). *Theraplay: New Therapy Using Structured Play for Problem Children and Their Families*. San Francisco CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Jernberg, A. M. and Booth, P. B. (2001). *Theraplay: Helping Parents and Children Build Better Relationships Through Attachment-Based Play*, 2nd Edition. San Francisco CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Kennedy, H., Landor, M. and Todd, L (eds.) (2011). *Video Interaction Guidance: A Relationship-Based Intervention to Promote Attunement, Empathy and Wellbeing*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers
- Leboyer, F. (1974). *Pour Une Naissance Sans Violence*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil
- Lester, B. and Sparrow J. D. (2012). (eds.) *Nurturing Young Children and Their Families: Building on the Legacy of T. B. Brazelton*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell Scientific
- Macmurray, J. (1959) *The Self as Agent* (Volume I of *The Form of the Personal*) London: Faber and Faber. (Paperback, 1969)
- Macmurray, J. (1961) *Persons in Relation* (Volume II of *The Form of the Personal*) London: Faber and Faber. (Paperback, 1970; New edition, with introduction by F. G. Fitzpatrick, Humanities Press International, 1991; reissued by Faber and Faber, 1995)
- Malloch, S. (1999) Mother and infants and communicative musicality. In: *Rhythms, Musical Narrative, and the Origins of Human Communication. Musicae Scientiae, Special Issue, 1999-2000*, Deliège, I., ed. Liège, Belgium: European Society for the Cognitive Sciences of Music, pp. 29-57.
- Malloch, S. (2017). Establishing a therapy of musicality: The embodied narratives of myself with others. In, Daniel, S. and Trevarthen, C. (eds.), *Rhythms of Relating: Stories from Children's Therapies*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers, pp. 63-81.
- Malloch, S. and Trevarthen, C. (2009). (Eds) *Communicative Musicality: Exploring the Basis of Human Companionship*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Maratos, O. (1982) Trends in development of imitation in early infancy. In T.G. Bever (Ed.), *Regressions in Mental Development: Basic Phenomena and Theories*, (pp. 81-101) Hillsdale, N.J., Erlbaum,.
- Maturana, H. R. (1978). Biology of language: The epistemology of reality. In: Miller, G. A., and Lenneberg, E. (Eds.) *Psychology and Biology of Language and Thought: Essays in Honor of Eric Lenneberg*. New York: Academic Press, pp. 27-63.
- Maturana, H. R. and Varela, F. J. (1980) *Autopoiesis and Cognition*. Dordrecht: D. Reidel.
- Meares, R. (2004). The conversational model: An outline. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, 58(1), 51–66
- Meares, R. (2005). *The Metaphor of Play: Origin and Breakdown of Personal Being*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Meares, R. (2016). *The Poet's Voice in the Making of Mind*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Meares, R., with Bendit, N., Haliburn, J., Korner, A., Mears, D., and Butt, D. (2012). *Borderline Personality Disorder and The Conversational Model: A Clinician's Manual*. Norton, New York.
- Murray, L., and Andrews, L. (2000). *The Social Baby: Understanding Babies' Communication from Birth*. Richmond, Surrey, UK: CP Publishing.
- Nagy, E. (2011). The newborn infant: A missing stage in developmental psychology. *Infant and Child Development*, 20: 3–19.
- Nagy, E., and Molnár, P. (2004). Homo imitans or homo provocans? Human imprinting model of neonatal imitation. *Infant Behavior and Development*, 27, 54–63.
- Narvaez, D. (2014). *Neurobiology and the Development of Human Morality*. New York: Norton.

- Narvaez, D., Braungart-Rieker, J. M., Miller-Graff, L. E., Gettler, L. T., and Hastings, P. D. (Eds.) (2016). *Contexts for Young Child Flourishing: Evolution, Family, and Society*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Nugent, K. and Morell, A. (2011). *Your Baby Is Speaking to You: A Visual Guide to the Amazing Behaviours of Your Newborn and Growing Baby*. New York: Houghton Mifflin.
- Osborne, N. (2017). Love, rhythm and chronobiology. In Daniel, S. and Trevarthen, C. (Eds.) *Rhythms of Relating in Children's Therapies: Connecting Creatively with Vulnerable Children*. London: Jessica Kingsley, pp. 14-27.
- Pavlicevic, M. (1997). *Music Therapy in Context: Music Meaning and Relationship*. London: Jessica Kingsley. ISBN 1 85302 434 1
- Pavlicevic, M. (1999). *Music Therapy: Intimate Notes*. Jessica Kingsley, London.
- Pavlicevic, M. and Ansdell, G. (2009). Between communicative musicality and collaborative musicing: A perspective from community music therapy. In Malloch, S. and Trevarthen, C. (eds.) *Communicative Musicality: Exploring the Basis of Human Companionship*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. pp. 357-376.
- Pavlicevic, M. and Trevarthen, C. (1989) A musical assessment of psychiatric states in adults, *Psychopathology*, 22: 325-334.
- Pavlicevic, M., Trevarthen, C., and Duncan, J. (1994). Improvisational music therapy and the rehabilitation of persons suffering from chronic schizophrenia. *Journal of Music Therapy*, 31(2), 86-104.
- Piaget, J. (1958). *The Child's Construction of Reality*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Piaget, J. (1966). *The Psychology of Intelligence*. Totawa, NJ: Littlefield Adams.
- Porges, S. W. (2011). *The Polyvagal Theory: Neurophysiological Foundations of Emotions, Attachment, Communication, and Self-regulation*. New York: WW Norton.
- Reddy, V. (2008). *How Infants Know Minds*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- Reid, T. (1764). *An Inquiry into the Human Mind on the Principles of Common Sense*. A. Millar, London, and A. Kincaid and J. Bell, Edinburgh.
- Sander, L. W. (1962) Issues in mother-child interaction. *Journal of the American Academy of Child Psychiatry*, 1(1): 141-166.
- Sander, L. W. (1964) Adaptive relationships in early mother-child interaction. *Journal of the American Academy of Child Psychiatry*, 3: 231-264.
- Sander, L. W. (2008). *Living Systems, Evolving Consciousness, and the Emerging Person: A Selection of Papers from the Life Work of Louis Sander*. Edited by G. Amadei and I. Bianchi. Abingdon: Taylor & Francis.
- Schore, A.N. (2001) Effects of a secure attachment on right brain development, affect regulation, and infant mental health. *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 22,7-67.
- Schore, A. N. (2003) *Affect Regulation and the Repair of the Self*. New York: Norton.
- Siegel, D. J. (2012). *The Developing Mind* 2nd Ed. New York: Guilford
- Smith, A. (1759) *Theory of Moral Sentiments*. Edinburgh (Modern Edition: D. D. Raphael and A.L. Macfie, General Editors, Glasgow Edition. Oxford: Clarendon, 1976. Reprint, Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, 1984.
- Smith, A. (1777/1982). Of the Nature of that Imitation which takes place in what are called the Imitative Arts. In W. P. D. Wightman and J. C. Bryce (eds.) with Dugald Stewart's account of Adam Smith (ed. I. S. Ross), D. D. Raphael and A. S. Skinner (General eds.), *Essays on Philosophical Subjects* (pp. 176-213). Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, 1982

- Spitz, R. A. (1945). Hospitalism—An Inquiry Into the Genesis of Psychiatric Conditions in Early Childhood. *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child*, 1, 53-74.
- Spitz, R. A. (1957). *No and Yes: On the Genesis of Human Communication*. New York : International Universities Press.
- Stern, D. N. (1971). A micro-analysis of mother-infant interaction: Behaviors regulating social contact between a mother and her three-and-a-half-month-old twins. *Journal of American Academy of Child Psychiatry*, 10, 501-517.
- Stern, D. N. (1985). *The Interpersonal World of the Infant: A View from Psychoanalysis and Development Psychology*. Basic Books, New York.
- Stern, D. N. (2000). *The Interpersonal World of the Infant: A View from Psychoanalysis and Development Psychology*. (Second Edition) Basic Books, New York.
- Stern, D. N. (2007). Applying developmental and neuroscience findings on other-centred participation to the process of change in psychotherapy. In Bråten, S. (Ed.) *On Being Moved: From Mirror Neurons to Empathy*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, pp. 35-47.
- Stern, D. N. (2010). *Forms of Vitality: Exploring Dynamic Experience in Psychology, the Arts, Psychotherapy and Development*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Stern, D. N., Beebe, B., Jaffe, J., and Bennett, S. L. (1977). The infant's stimulus world during social interaction: a study of caregiver behaviors with particular reference to repetition and timing. In H. R. Schaffer (Ed.), *Studies in Mother-Infant Interaction*, (pp. 177-202). New York: Academic Press.
- Stern, D. N., Bruschiweiler-Stern, N., Harrison, A. M., Lyons-Ruth, K., Morgan, A. C., Nahum, J. P., Sander, L. and Tronick, E. Z. (1999). The process of therapeutic change involving implicit knowledge: Some implications of developmental observations for adult psychotherapy. *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 19(3), 300-8.
- Trevarthen, C. (1974). Conversations with a two-month-old. *New Scientist*, 2 May: 230-235.
- Trevarthen, C. (1979). Communication and cooperation in early infancy. A description of primary intersubjectivity. In M. Bullowa (Ed.) *Before Speech: The Beginning of Human Communication*. London, Cambridge University Press, , 321-347.
- Trevarthen, C. (1988). Universal cooperative motives: How infants begin to know language and skills of culture. In G. Jahoda and I.M. Lewis (Eds.), *Acquiring Culture: Ethnographic Perspectives on Cognitive Development*, (pp. 37-90). London: Croom Helm.
- Trevarthen, C. (1989). Motives for culture in young children - their natural development through communication. In, Walter Koch (Ed.) *The Nature of Culture*. Bochum: Brockmeyer, 80-119.
- Trevarthen, C. (2001). Intrinsic motives for companionship in understanding: their origin, development, and significance for infant mental health. *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 22, 95-131.
- Trevarthen, C. (2011). The generation of human meaning: How shared experience grows in infancy. In *Joint Attention: New Developments in Philosophy, Psychology, and Neuroscience*, edited by Axel Seemann, 2011, MIT Press, 73-113.
- Trevarthen, C. (2016). Sharing joyful friendship and imagination for meaning with infants, and their application in early intervention. In Stella Acquarone (Ed.) *Surviving the Early Years: The Importance of Early Intervention with Babies at Risk*. London: Karnak, pp. 19-55.
- Trevarthen, C. (2017). The affectionate intersubjective intelligence of the infant, and its innate motives for relational mental health. *International Journal of Cognitive Analytic Therapy and Relational Mental Health*, 1(1), March 2017: 11-53.

- Trevarthen, C. and Malloch, S. (2017). Grace in moving and joy in sharing: the intrinsic beauty of communicative musicality from birth. In, S. Bunn, Ed. *Anthropology and Beauty: From Aesthetics to Creativity*. London: Taylor & Francis/Routledge, Chapter 8, pp. 115-130.
- Turner, V. W. (1982). *From Ritual to Theatre: The Human Seriousness of Play*. New York: PAJ Publications.
- Varela, F. J., Thompson, E. and Rosch, E. (1991) *The Embodied Mind*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1958) *Playing and Reality*. London: Tavistock.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1964) *The Child, The Family and The Outside World*. London: Penguin Books.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1965) *The Maturation Process and the Facilitating Environment*. London: Hogarth.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1987) *Babies and Their Mothers*. (Edited by: C. Winnicott, R. Sheperd, M. Davis). Reading, Mass.: Addison Wesley.